

PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE
21 January 2016

Item No:

<u>UPRN</u>	<u>APPLICATION NO.</u>	<u>DATE VALID</u>
	15/P3058	10/08/2015
Address/Site:	10 Dunstall Road, West Wimbledon, SW20 0HR	
(Ward)	Village	
Proposal:	Demolition of existing single storey rear extension and erection of a part single part two storey rear extension.	
Drawing No's:	Site Location Plan, Design and Access Statement, 660/LOC P1, 660/001 P1, 660/002 P1, 660/003 P1, 660/004 P1, 660/005 P1, 660/006 P1, 660/007 P1, 660/009 P3, 660/010 P4, 660/012 P2, 660/013 P3, 660/014 P3, 660/014 P5, 660/015 P3, 660/016 A, 660/017 A.	
Contact Officer:	Lucas Zoricak (0208 545 3112)	

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT Permission subject to Conditions

CHECKLIST INFORMATION

- Heads of Agreement: None
- Is a screening opinion required: No
- Is an Environmental Statement required: No
- Has an Environmental Statement been submitted: No
- Press notice: No
- Site notice: Yes
- Design Review Panel consulted: No
- Number of neighbours consulted: 2
- External consultations: No
- Controlled Parking Zone: No

1. **INTRODUCTION**

This application is being brought to the Planning Applications Committee for determination due to the number of objections received.

2. **SITE AND SURROUNDINGS**

2.1 The application site comprises a two storey detached property located along a well-established residential road of other detached properties of similar designs and materials. The property has been extended at ground floor level (single storey rear extension) and second floor level (rear roof extension) previously.

2.2 The existing house was constructed in the 1930s, on a sloping site on the north side of Dunstall Road, with ground floor raised approximately 3m above road level, over two storeys, with a garage at lower ground (road) level and steeply sloping front garden. The neighboring property no. 12 Dunstall Road, is set approximately 1.7m lower than no. 10.

2.3 The rear boundary facing Lady Jane's Wood is well vegetated with hedgerows and some trees. The neighbouring properties 12 and 8 Dunstall Road are separated from the application site by a high level timber fence and vegetation.

2.4 The application site is located in the Wool Road Conservation Area. The particular characteristics that merit this area's designation as a conservation area derives from the early 20th Century architecture and diverse styling of the large 'ornate' detached house, the uniform street design including grass verges, and natural landscaping of the surrounding area and views towards Wimbledon Common, particularly from Wool and McKay Roads.

3. **CURRENT PROPOSAL**

3.1 This application comprises the proposed demolition of the existing single storey rear extension and erection of a part single part two storey rear extension.

3.2 The proposed extension would be located at the rear of the property, which means it would also not be visible from the public domain. The single storey element would extend 5m from the rear main wall of the original dwelling house adjacent to the boundary with 8 Dunstall Road.

Adjacent to no.12, it would extend 3m from the rear main wall of the original dwelling house, before recessing in by 1m and extending for a further 2m. The extension would include a centrally located, two storey rear element (5m in depth, 4.3m in width, an eaves height of 5.1m and with a ridge height of 7m). The ground floor element would be 2.5m high at the eaves and 3.5m high at the ridge.

- 3.3 The ground floor element would comprise a kitchen and library/study and would also directly access the garden to the rear. The first floor element would comprise a gym.
- 3.4 The proposed extension would be sympathetic to the original building and would be constructed of brickwork at ground level and white render at first floor level to match existing, with a tiled roof for the upper storey, standing seam zinc roof for the single storey element, windows and sliding-folding doors of grey metal to match roof colour. Boundary treatments would remain as existing.

4. **PLANNING HISTORY**

07/P2798 – APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF LAWFULNESS FOR PROPOSED NEW FRONT BOUNDARY WALL – Issued – 31/10/2007.

09/P1473 – ERECTION OF A REAR DORMER ROOF EXTENSION – Granted – 07/09/2009.

04/P2182 – PROPOSED SINGLE STOREY REAR EXTENSION AND ALTERNATIONS TO THE FRONT ELEVATION – Issued – 29/11/2004.

5. **CONSULTATION**

- 5.1 The proposal has been publicised by means of Conservation Area site and press notice and 2 individual neighbour notification letters.
- 5.2 In response to initial consultation 10 letters of objection have been received from neighbours in Dunstall Road and surrounding roads and from North West Wimbledon Residents' Association.
- 5.3 In response to the first reconsultation, 7 letters of objection have been received reiterating previous objections.

The stated objections and concerns relate to the following matters:-

- The proposal would project significantly deeper into the rear garden than any of the adjoining properties and would alter the character of

the rear gardens, it would set a damaging precedent, out of scale, adverse impact on Wool Road Conservation Area, overdevelopment of the site

- The proposal would block light and outlook to no.12 Dunstall Road because of the rear projection, and would result in loss of privacy and overlooking
- The development by reason of its size, depth, width, height and massing would have an unacceptably adverse impact on the amenities of the properties immediately adjacent to the site and surrounding area by reason of overlooking, loss of privacy and visual impact.

Further to the final revision, reducing the size of the ground floor element in relation to 12 Dunstall Road, a further representation has been received from the occupiers of 12 Dunstall Road.

The stated objections and concerns relate to the following matters:-

- The proposed extension would result in overshadowing and deprivation of light, spaciousness and privacy
- Bias in favour of the applicant
- The assessment of the aspect value calculation should have been carried out by a qualified expert at or on behalf of the Council. The applicant's sun/daylight assessments were not prepared by experts in sunlight and daylight impact
- The change in ground floor levels and construction of two storey extension would overshadow the conservatory and windows in the rear elevation
- The existing extension at 12 Dunstall Road would be exposed to the proposed side elevation window at first floor level and would result in overlooking
- The proposal by reason of its size, depth, width, height, bulk and massing would have an unacceptably adverse impact on the amenities of 12 Dunstall Road
- The applicant has not provided 3D aerial view of the proposal viewed from no. 12 Dunstall Road

6. **POLICY CONTEXT**

- 6.1 Adopted Merton Core Strategy (July 2011).
CS14 (Design)
- 6.2 Adopted Merton Sites and Policies Plan (July 2014).
DM D2 (Design Considerations in all Developments), DM D3 (Alterations and Extension to Existing Buildings), DM D4 (Managing Heritage Assets).
- 6.3 Supplementary Planning Guidance: Residential Extensions, Alterations and Conversions (2001). Supplementary Planning Document: Wool Road Conservation Area Assessment and Design Guide (2002).

7. **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

- 7.1 The principal planning considerations in this case relate to the design and appearance of the development and its impact upon the character of the conservation area and the potential for the development to cause harm to the amenity of neighbouring properties.

7.2 **Design and Visual Amenity / Conservation Issues**

- 7.3 The site is located within the Wool Road Conservation Area and the character assessment states:

'The front gardens in particular are important in contributing to the character of the area, as together with the mature trees that line the roads they create an important softening of the street scene. Particularly significant to the conservation area is the open nature of the front garden areas. Rear gardens contribute significantly to the nature conservation/ecological value of the area.'

- 7.4 The proposed extension would be located to the rear of the property thus not visible from the public realm. Accordingly, the proposal would not have an adverse impact on the appearance and character of the conservation area.

- 7.5 The scheme has been amended since its original submission in the following ways:

- Significant reduction in size of two storey element, moving it to a central position and removing the first floor elements closest to the boundaries with 8 and 12, so that it sits 5.6m away from the boundaries

- Ground floor, the side wall facing no.12 has been reduced to the permitted development limits of 3m before stepping in by 1m to extend a further 2m
 - Reduction in height from an eaves height of 2.7m to an eaves height of 2.5m at the boundary with no. 12 and no. 8 Dunstall Road
- 7.6 The proposed extension would be sympathetic to the original dwelling house in terms of the design and materials used. Given the siting of the extension, there is considered to be no adverse impact on the application site and the Wool Road Conservation Area.
- 7.7 In light of the above, the proposed development is considered to be acceptable in terms of its design, layout, and form, and it is not considered that the proposed extension would result in harm being caused to the character of the Wool Road Conservation Area and would therefore comply with the aims and Policies DM D2, DM D3, DM D4 and CS14.
- 7.8 **Impact on Residential Amenity**
- 7.9 The provisions of policy DM D3 (Alterations and Extension to Existing Buildings) and the relevant Supplementary Planning Guidance's (SPGs) require there would not be a detrimental impact on the residential amenities of the occupiers of the adjoining properties as a result of a proposed development.
- 7.10 It is considered that there would not be a detrimental impact on the outlook or daylight/sunlight of the occupiers of the properties nearest to the site sufficient to warrant refusal. The first floor element is now substantially recessed away from both neighbouring properties. It would be set away approximately 5.6m from the boundary with no. 12 Dunstall Road and approximately 6.3m from the boundary with no. 8 Dunstall Road, and the single storey elements either side are also set away from the boundary. Although it is acknowledged that the impact on no 12 will be greater because of the 1.7m difference in ground levels, the proposed single storey extension replaces an existing flat roofed extension with a greater eaves height and is recessed by 1m for the final 2m of its 5m total depth. It meets the Council's Aspect Value Test and is not considered to have a significantly greater impact on outlook than the existing extension to be replaced.
- 7.11 There is a vertical window (1.3m x 0.6m) proposed in each side elevation. However, conditions are proposed prohibiting the insertion of any new windows/doors without planning permission, requiring the first floor side windows to be obscured glazed, fixed and permanently retained as such, and removing permitted development rights in order to protect residential

amenity. As such, there would not be a loss of privacy to the occupiers of the adjoining properties from the proposed windows in the side elevations.

- 7.12 In light of the above, the proposals would not result in any loss of amenity to occupiers of neighbouring properties and the proposal accords with policy DM D3 (Alternations and Extension to Existing Buildings).

8. **CONCLUSION**

- 8.1 It is considered that the proposed demolition of the existing single storey rear extension and erection of a part single part two storey rear extension is acceptable in conservation terms and design terms, would preserve the character and appearance of the conservation area. It is also considered that the proposed development would not result in a detrimental impact on the residential amenities of the occupiers of the adjoining properties. Accordingly, it is recommended that planning permission be granted.

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION subject to the following conditions:

1. A1 Commencement of Development (Full Application)
2. A7 Plans
3. B2 Matching materials
4. C2 No Additional Windows (In side elevations of new extension)
5. C3 Obscured Glazing (Fixed Windows)
6. D11 Hours of Construction

Informatives: Note 1

This page is intentionally left blank